

Date: _____

Essay Title: _____

Author: _____

Reader: _____

Directions:

Do not get bogged down in correcting grammar and punctuation. Please address all the criteria below for your writing group member's draft and return that draft to the writer. Budget your time so that you are able to cover all these areas in writing. Verbally discuss only what you think are the most pressing concerns below. Just tell the writer that s/he has serious grammar or punctuation problems and needs to edit very carefully on the final draft before submitting it.

	YES	NO
1. The thesis is clearly and precisely stated in the last sentence of the introductory ¶.		
2. The essay is organized around two toys and analyzes their possible meanings/interpretations.		
3. The essay has good supportive evidence ; it moves beyond general claims and supports them.		
4. Each main body ¶ begins with a topic sentence that limits what that ¶ can discuss.		
5. All the main body ¶s are unified and are limited to developing just one main idea within each one.		
6. The writer needs to edit carefully for grammar and spelling in the next draft.		
7. The essay needs work in the area of punctuation .		

8. Give the writer very constructive feedback on each of the following: a) Is the introductory ¶ really, really developed? b) Explain whether it really **invites** you to read further? c) Has it **truly** grabbed and hooked your attention?
A)

B)

C)

9. A) Evaluate whether the thesis is forceful and assertive. Explain.

B) Give the writer an example of how s/he could state the thesis more clearly, even if you think it's pretty good.

11. What parts of the essay do not strongly support the thesis of the essay? What parts of the essay are confusing to you?

12. Evaluate each main body paragraph for unity (write your comments directly on the writer's draft).

13. Identify the ¶ that needs the **most work** on **coherency** (smooth ideas, orderly sequence of sentences, no jumbled ideas).

14. Give an example of a well-written passage. Explain why you chose it.

15. What other questions and/or comments do you have for this writer?

16. The following areas can be strengthened (check all that apply & specifically mark them on the essay draft; briefly explain):

___ topic sentences

___ ¶ coherency and smoothness

___ ¶ transitions

___ wordiness

___ word choice/specificity

17. On a scale of 1 - 6, rate the content of this draft. (Be honest, and don't give the writer false expectations!)

(very difficult to follow; lacks clear reasoning; needs more examples)

1

2

3

4

5

6

(clear organization; strong development of ideas; uses forceful, direct prose)